



FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume II

Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

1994-1995

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair and Ella Schwartz

* * *

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP 8 1994

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume II

**Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto**

1994-1995

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair and Ella Schwartz

* * *

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

FAMILY LAW

Table of Contents

Volume II

	<u>Page No.</u>
V. MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY	
A. Historical Overview	
(a) <u>Common Law</u>	
OLRC, <i>Report on Family Law, Part IV: Family Property</i>	457
(b) <u>Trust Doctrine</u>	
LRCC, <i>Family Property</i>	460
Note: <i>Murdoch v. Murdoch</i>	462
<i>Rathwell v. Rathwell</i>	463
<i>Pettkus v. Becker</i>	473
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Woman's Suicide Ends Fight for Rights"	485
<i>Sorochan v. Sorochan</i>	486
Note: Recent Decisions on Unjust Enrichment and Constructive Trust	493
<i>Peter v. Beblow</i>	495
(c) <u>Statutory Reform</u>	
Holland, "Reform of Matrimonial Property Law in Ontario"	516
Wolfson, <i>The New Family Law Act</i>	518
B. The F.L.A.	
(a) <u>The Partnership Principle</u>	
Knetsch, "Some Economic Implications of Matrimonial Property Rules"	524
Prager, "Shifting Perspectives on Marital Property Law"	533
Eekelaar, <i>Family Law and Social Policy</i> , "Adjustment on Divorce"	538
Fineman, "Implementing Equality"	542
Mossman, Book Review of Weitzman's <i>Divorce Revolution</i>	548
Note: Application of Matrimonial Property Law to Indian Women	551

(b) Pre-Marital Contracts

<i>New York Times</i> , "Prenuptial Stress over the Contract"	552
Wolfson, "The Use and Abuse of Marriage Contracts" from <i>Money and Family Law</i>	555

(c) Overview of Equalization of Net Family
Property Under the FLA

(i) Calculation of the Equalization Payment

Goodman, "Matrimonial Property", <i>Family Law</i> Bar Admission Course Materials	558
<i>Skrlj v. Skrlj</i>	571
<i>Folga v. Folga</i>	576
<i>Miller v. Miller</i>	579
<i>Black v. Black</i>	580
Fredricks, "The Onwership Conundrum"	584
Wolfson and Corbin, "Problems of Title and and Constructive Trusts"	586
Note: Proposed Amendments to the FLA587	
— Note: Ontario Law Reform Commission 1993 Recommendations	588

(ii) Implementation of the Equalization Payment

<i>Humphreys v. Humphreys</i>	589
Goodman, "Matrimonial Property", <i>Family Law</i> Bar Admission Course Materials	595

(d) Selected Problems in Determining NFP

(i) Valuation and Costs of Disposition

Goodman, "Matrimonial Property", <i>Family Law</i> Bar Admission Course Materials	599
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Ontario 'debtor-creditor' family law benefits property-owning spouse"	604
— <i>Sengmueller v. Sengmueller</i>	606

(ii) Future Interests

<i>Brinkos v. Brinkos</i>	610
-------------------------------------	-----

(iii)	<u>Educational Degrees, Professional Licenses and other forms of "Human Capital"</u>	
	Weitzman, "The New Property" in <i>The Divorce Revolution</i>	616
	Trebilcock and Keshvani, "A Law and Economics Perspective on the Role of Private Ordering in Family Law"	623
	Dulude, <i>Love, Marriage and Money</i>	630
	Selick, "Pitfalls in Professional Degree Valuation"	634
	<i>Corless v. Corless</i>	635
	<i>Caratun v. Caratun</i>	641
	<i>Keast v. Keast</i>	657
	<i>Linton v. Linton</i>	661
	<i>Chaulk v. Chaulk</i> (<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i>)	670
	<i>New York Times</i> , "Her Fame is Ruled His Too: Soprano Must Share Income"	671
	<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Gastineau a loser in Court"	672
	Note: <i>Drummond v. Smith; Ormerod v. Ormerod</i>	673
(iv)	<u>Relevance of Constructive Trust</u>	
	<i>Kelly v. Kelly</i>	674
	<i>Rawluk v. Rawluk</i>	676
	Note: Applications of Constructive Trust under the <i>FLA</i> (<i>Cox, Hapichuk, Mittler, Heon, McDonald</i>)	703
	<i>Arndt v. Arndt</i>	706
	Ontario Law Reform Commission 1993 Recommendations . . .	712
(e)	<u>Departures from Equal Sharing</u>	
(i)	<u>Unequal Contributions</u>	
	<i>Farr v. Farr</i>	713
	<i>LeBlanc v. LeBlanc</i>	716
	<i>Toronto Star</i> , "A New Day in a Hard Life"	721
	<i>Waters v. Waters</i>	722
	<i>Sullivan v. Sullivan</i>	726
	<i>Berdette v. Berdette</i>	728
	Note: <i>Peake; McInnis</i>	734
	<i>Wakelin v. Wakelin</i> (<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i>)	735
(ii)	<u>Depletion of Assets; Conduct</u>	

	<i>Scott v. Scott</i>	736
	Note: <i>Cowan</i>	738
	<i>Merklinger v. Merklinger</i>	739
	<i>Tamitegana v. Tamitegana (Lawyer's Weekly)</i>	741
(iii)	<u>Short Marriage; Pre-Marital Property</u>	
	<i>Murphy v. Murphy</i>	743
	Note: <i>Jordan</i>	745
	<i>Futia v. Futia (Lawyer's Weekly)</i>	746
(iv)	<u>Post-Separation Needs and Other Post-Separation Events</u>	
	<i>Davies v. Davies</i>	747
	Note: <i>Skrlj; McCutcheon; Crane</i>	748
(v)	<u>Lump Sum Support as Alternative to Unequal Division of NFP</u>	
	<i>Magee v. Magee</i>	749
	<i>MacBride v. MacBride (Lawyer's Weekly)</i>	751
	<i>Hines v. Hines</i>	752
—	Note: Ontario Law Reform Commission 1993 Recommendations	755

VI. THE MATRIMONIAL HOME

A. Introduction

(a) The Matrimonial Home as a Special Asset

Hovius, "The Matrimonial Home" 757

(b) History of Legal Rights in the Matrimonial Home

Hovius, "Possessory Rights in the Matrimonial Home" 758

B. The Matrimonial Home Under the Family Law Act, 1986

(a) Overview of Part II of the FLA

Wolfson and Corbin, "The Matrimonial Home Under the FLA"	761
<i>Nurmi v. Nurmi</i>	766

(b) Orders for Exclusive Possession

Bissett-Johnson and Holland, <i>Matrimonial Property</i> <i>Law in Canada</i>	770
--	-----

(i) Exclusive Possession or Sale at Trial?

Weitzman, "Disposition of the Family Home" from <i>The Divorce Revolution</i>	772
<i>Rosenthal v. Rosenthal</i>	777
<i>Cicero v. Cicero</i>	779
Note: Review of Case Law	780
Note: Exclusive Possession on the Basis of Emotional Attachment to the Matrimonial Home	781
Note: Alternatives to Exclusive Possession	782

(ii) Interim or Temporary Exclusive Possession: Excluding a Spouse from the Matrimonial Home

<i>Pifer v. Pifer</i>	783
<i>Serruys v. Serruys</i>	786
<i>Hill v. Hill</i>	789

(c) Groups Precluded from Protection

(i) Unmarried Cohabitants

Orlando, "Exclusive Possession of the Family Home: The Plight of Battered Cohabitees"	795
Note: <i>Czora v. Lonergan</i>	797

(ii) Native Women

Note: <i>Derrickson v. Derrickson</i> , <i>Paul v. Paul</i> , <i>and Wynn v. Wynn</i>	797
--	-----

VII. SPOUSAL SUPPORT

A. Historical Origins of Spousal Support

Eekelaar and Maclean, <i>Maintenance After Divorce</i>	798
--	-----

B. Law Reform: Modern Spousal Support Law

Eekelaar and Maclean, "The Evolution of Private Law Maintenance Obligations"	800
LRCC, <i>Maintenance on Divorce</i>	804
Davies, "The Changing Face of Spousal Support Law in Canada"	806
Smart, <i>The Ties that Bind</i>	811
Rogerson, "The Causal Connection Test"	813

C. Spousal Support Under the Divorce Act, 1985 and the Family Law Act, 1986

(a) The Trilogy and the Causal Connection Test

<i>Messier v. Delage</i>	827
Note: The Supreme Court of Canada "Trilogy"	841
<i>Pelech v. Pelech</i>	842
<i>Richardson v. Richardson</i>	860
Rogerson, "The Causal Connection Test in Spousal Support Law" ...	874
Note: The Causal Connection Test after the "Trilogy"	879

(b) The Self-Sufficiency Principle and Compensation for the Economic Consequences of the Marriage

Dept. of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i>	880
Rogerson, "Judicial Interpretation of the Spousal and Child Support Provisions of the Divorce Act, 1985"	882
<i>Karlovec v. Karlovec</i>	886
<i>Seward v. Seward</i>	889
<i>Bast v. Bast</i>	891
— Note: The Demise of the Causal Connection Test	892
<i>Heinemann v. Heinemann</i>	894
<i>Ormerod v. Ormerod</i>	900
— <i>Elliot v. Elliot</i>	909
<i>Moge v. Moge</i>	915
— <i>Robinson v. Robinson</i>	939

(c) Illness

Note	949
LRCC, <i>Maintenance on Divorce</i>	949

(d) Conduct

<i>Anderson v. Anderson (Lawyer's Weekly)</i>	951
<i>MacDonald v. MacDonald (Lawyer's Weekly)</i>	952
— <i>Melanson v. Melanson (Lawyer's Weekly)</i>	953
— <i>Krigstin v. Krigston (Lawyer's Weekly)</i>	954

(e) On-going Child Care Responsibilities and Spousal Support

LRCC, <i>Maintenance on Divorce</i>	960
<i>Desmarais v. Desmarais</i>	961
<i>Brockie v. Brockie</i>	963
<i>Thorsteinson v. Thorsteinson</i>	967
<i>Jull v. Jull</i>	969
<i>Fejes v. Fejes</i>	972

